COST18108 QG-MM Conference 14.07.2022

Gravitational waves propagation as a probe of quantum and alternative theories of gravity

Leïla Haegel

Université Paris-Cité, CNR\$, Astroparticule et Cosmologie, F-75006 Paris, France

Outline

- Gravitational waves physics
 - \mapsto nature and sources
- \hookrightarrow detectors and instruments
- \mapsto detection status
- \hookrightarrow analysis methods

Propagation tests with multi messenger events

- \hookrightarrow gravitational waves friction
- \mapsto gravitational waves lensing
- \hookrightarrow speed of gravity
- └→ tests of Lorentz invariance violation

Propagation tests with gravitational waves signals

- \rightarrow modified dispersion relation
- \mapsto mass of the graviton
- └→ tests of Lorentz invariance & CPT breaking
- → anisotropies and spacetime birefringence

Outline: GW physics

- Gravitational waves physics
 - \mapsto nature and sources
 - \hookrightarrow detectors and instruments
- \mapsto detection status
- \hookrightarrow analysis methods

Gravitational waves primer

• A propagating space-time perturbation predicted by GR Gravitational waves (GW) modify a spacetime interval as:

$$ds^{2} = -c \ dt^{2} + [1 + h(z \pm ct)] \ dx^{2} + [1 - h(z \pm ct)] \ dy^{2} + dz^{2}$$

propagate at speed of light

GW deformation

transverse waves

Properties:

2 polarisation states, h_+ and h_{\times} Tensor perturbation Quadrupolar radiation

Deformation:

Strain = fractional change in distance between two points when a GW passes through:

$$\frac{\Delta L}{L} = \frac{1}{2} h_{xx}(0, ct)$$



Gravitational waves sources

Early Universe quantum fluctuations



Leïla Haegel

5

Gravitational waves observatories



LIGO Hanford











Gravitational waves detection: a summary

90 deteo repo	GW ctions orted	Coalesc of black and neutro	ence holes on stars	1 multimes event (GW observa	s enger / + EM tion)	Mass range 1.2 → 107 M (stellar)	e Dis 1 _⊙ 40	stance range Mpc → 8 Gpc (z → 1.14)	
~~~	ML					•••			
2015	01   2016	O2   2017	2018	2019	03a 03b 2020	2021	2022	2023	
		1 coales system electror counter	scing binar of neutron nagnetic part detec	ry stars: ted				in 20 Dura 1 yea	23 tion: ar
	of black holes <b>8 GW detection dur</b>			uring O2	<ul> <li>35 during O3b, including 2 confirmed systems of neutron stars - black holes</li> <li>No electromagnetic counterpart</li> </ul>				o start
	First direct detection of GW				44 during O3a, including 1 confirmed				01045 03606
	r 3 GW detection during O1			1	▶ 79 GW detection during O3			ar) 1811.	liv 12907

**Matched filtering**: correlation between the signal template *h* and the data *s* most efficient way to find a very low amplitude signal



 $z(t) = 4 \int h^*(f) \ s(f) \ \exp(2\pi i f t) \ df$ 

Source: L. Candonati

►

### GW analysis with matched filtering

 Matched filtering: correlation between the signal template h and the data s most efficient way to find a very low amplitude signal



 $z(t) = 4 \int h^*(f) \ s(f) \ \exp(2\pi i f t) \ df$ 

Source: L. Candonati

### GW analysis with matched filtering

 Matched filtering: correlation between the signal template h and the data s most efficient way to find a very low amplitude signal



$$z(t) = 4 \int h^*(f) \ s(f) \ \exp(2\pi i f t) \ df$$

Source: L. Candonati

**Bayesian analyses**: joint posterior probabilities of source parameters Markov chains sampling methods (Nested sampling, MCMC)

#### Binary systems of black holes and/or neutron stars:

15 parameters minimum

- 2 masses

►

►

- 2 spin magnitudes
- 2 angles for each spin
- Reference time
- Orbital phase at reference time
- Luminosity distance
- Right ascension & declination
- Inclination angle
- Polarisation angle
- + tidal parameters in neutron stars



Ashton et al, Astrophys.J.Suppl. 241 (2019) 2, 27

### Tests of general relativity

- Gravitational waves (GW) enable to test
   fundamental physics in the gravitational sector
   complementary to tests with solar system,
   pulsars, gravitational lensing...
- Several approaches to test for deviation from General Relativity
- └→ consistency tests
- → search for phenomena impacting GW generation
- $\hookrightarrow$  search for exotic compact objects...
- New physics may affect the propagation of GW
  - → gravitational coupling
  - → overall effect on the signal (independent of the source)
- $\mapsto$  cumulative effect
- → dynamical regime at large distance due to Universe expansion

# LVK, arxiv:2112.06861





#### Outline: tests with multi messenger events

- Gravitational waves physics
  - $\mapsto$  nature and sources
  - $\mapsto$  detectors and instruments
  - └→ detection status
  - → analysis methods

#### Propagation tests with multi messenger events

- $\hookrightarrow$  gravitational waves friction
- $\hookrightarrow$  gravitational waves lensing
- $\hookrightarrow$  speed of gravity
- └→ tests of Lorentz invariance violation

#### Gravitational waves propagation

General relativity (GR) case:



Can be probed with multimessenger events

Can be probed from GW signal (pattern & polarisation)

### Gravitational waves propagation

General relativity (GR) case:

$$h_{ij}'' + 2 H h_{ij} + c^2 k^2 h_{ij} = 0$$

$$\underbrace{\text{Modified GR}}_{97, 104037 (2018)}$$

$$h_{ij}'' + (2 + \nu) H h_{ij} + (c_T^2 k^2 + a^2 \mu^2) h_{ij} = a^2 \Gamma \gamma_{ij}$$

$$\underbrace{\text{GW friction}}_{\text{Amplitude}}$$

does not scale as 1/distance

#### Gravitational waves friction

- •GW friction: a dispersion impacting the amplitude of the waveform
- •Observable: the luminosity distance is modified compared to GR

$$d_L^{GW}(z) = d_L^{EM} \exp\left[\frac{1}{2} \int_0^z \frac{\alpha_M(z')}{1+z'} dz'\right]$$

- $\alpha_M(z)$  can be mapped to different alternative theories of gravitation
- $\bullet \ln \operatorname{GR}, \, \alpha_M(z) = 0$



Belgacem, Dirian, Foffa, Maggiore, Phys. Rev. D 97, 104066 (2018)

### Standard sirens

- Standard siren = simultaneous observation of electromagnetic and gravitational radiation from the same event
- The distance (luminosity distance & redshift) can be separately inferred from the two signals, enabling to measure cosmological and GW friction parameters
- → GW170817:
  - binary neutron star merger
    z ≈ 0.01



LVC, Phys. Rev. Lett. 119, 161101 (2017)

• GW190521:

- binary black holes merger
- potential location in AGN disk creating electromagnetic signal (not confirmed)
  z ~ 0.44



LVC, Phys. Rev. Lett. 125, 101102 (2020) Graham et al, Phys. Rev. Lett. 124, 251102 (2020)

### From GW friction to scalar-tensor theories

Scalar-tensor theories of gravitation parameterisation ► (Brans-Dicke, Horndeski, beyond-Horndeski, DHOST



ntion d ⁽ DST)	$d_L^{GW}(z) = d_L^{EM}(z)$	$\left[\Xi + \frac{1}{(1)}\right]$	$\left[\frac{1-\Xi}{1+z}\right]$
Model	$\Xi_0 - 1$	<u>n</u>	Refs.
HS $f(R)$ gravity	$rac{1}{2}f_{R0}$	$\frac{3(\tilde{n}+1)\Omega_m}{4-3\Omega_m}$	[68]
Designer $f(R)$ gravity	$-0.24\Omega_m^{0.76}B_0$	$3.1\Omega_m^{0.24}$	[69]
Jordan-Brans-Dicke	$rac{1}{2}\delta\phi_0$	$\tfrac{3(\tilde{n}+1)\Omega_m}{4-3\Omega_m}$	[70]
Galileon cosmology	$rac{eta \phi_0}{2 M_{ m Pl}}$	$rac{\dot{\phi}_0}{H_0\phi}$	[71]
$\alpha_M = \alpha_{M0} a^{ ilde{n}}$	$rac{lpha_{M0}}{2 ilde{n}}$	$ ilde{n}$	[67]
$lpha_M=lpha_{M0}rac{\Omega_\Lambda(a)}{\Omega_\Lambda}$	$-rac{lpha_{M0}}{6\Omega_\Lambda}\ln\Omega_m$	$-rac{3\Omega_\Lambda}{\ln\Omega_m}$	[67, 72]
$\Omega = 1 + \Omega_+ a^{\tilde{n}}$	$rac{1}{2}\Omega_+$	$ ilde{n}$	[6]
Minimal self-acceleration	$\lambda \left( \ln a_{acc} + \frac{C}{2} \chi_{acc} \right)$	$rac{C/H_0-2}{\ln a_{acc}^2-C\chi_{acc}}$	[66]

Mastrogiovanni, Haegel, Karathanasis, Magana-Hernandez, Steer, JCAP 02 (2021) 043

Belgacem et al, JCAP07 (2019) 024

18

### GW friction and extra dimensions

Extra dimensions
 DGP gravity (4+1 dimensions),
 quantum gravity models of large extra dimensions



$$d_L^{GW}(z) = \left[ 1 + \left( \frac{d_L^{EM}(z)}{R_c} \right)^n \right]^{\frac{D-2}{2n}}$$

 D=4 is on the edge on the contour due to the luminosity distance posterior skewed towards large values



Mastrogiovanni, Haegel, Karathanasis, Magana-Hernandez, Steer, JCAP 02 (2021) 043



Mastrogiovanni, Haegel, Karathanasis, Magana-Hernandez, Steer, JCAP 02 (2021) 043

Dynamical dark energy models:  $\alpha_M$  is linked to the energy content of the Universe

$$\alpha_M = c_M \frac{\Omega_{\Lambda(z)}}{\Omega_{\Lambda(0)}}$$

►

$$d_L^{GW}(z) = d_L^{EM}(z) \exp\left[\frac{c_M}{2\Omega_{\Lambda,0}} \ln \frac{1+z}{\Omega_{m,0} (1+z)^3 + \Omega_{\Lambda,0}}\right]$$

$$c_M = 0$$
 is the GR case

## GW friction and lensing

- Quadruply lensed GW events event amplitude and arrival time modified due to the presence of gravitational lensing
- Several images of same event better sky localisation reconstruction can be matched with host galaxy





- Access to larger distance more accuracy on some parameters
- ► Work with Nikhef group see <u>H. Narola talk at GR23 [C3]</u>

### Gravitational waves propagation

General relativity (GR) case:

$$h_{ij}'' + 2 H h_{ij} + c^{2} k^{2} h_{ij} = 0$$

$$\underbrace{\text{Modified GR}}_{97, 104037 (2018)}$$

$$h_{ij}'' + (2 + \nu) H h_{ij} + (c_{T}^{2}k^{2} + a^{2}\mu^{2}) h_{ij} = a^{2} \Gamma \gamma_{ij}$$

$$\underbrace{\text{Speed of}}_{\text{gravity}}$$

$$\underbrace{\text{Speed of}}_{\text{GW} \neq c}$$

•GW170817: binary neutron star merger

•Time delay: between GW and GRB

 $\Delta t = 1.74 \pm 0.05 \text{ s}$ 

• Speed of gravity: can be measured from  $\Delta t$ 

$$-3 \times 10^{-15} \leqslant \frac{\Delta \nu}{\nu_{\rm EM}} \leqslant +7 \times 10^{-16}$$



LVC, Fermi, Integral, Astrophys.J.Lett. 848 (2017) 2, L13

## The Standard Model Extension (SME) framework

#### • A framework to probe new physics:

Lagrangian description of new physics New fields coupling know physics Extensive constraints from the (astro)particle physics sector

$$\begin{aligned} \mathscr{L}_{SME} &= \mathscr{L}_{SM} + \mathscr{L}_{GR} \\ &+ \mathscr{L}_{LI} + \mathscr{L}_{LV} \\ &+ \mathscr{L}_{CPT-C} + \mathscr{L}_{CPT-V} \end{aligned}$$

Kostelecky & Russell, arxiv:0801.0287



Schreck, arXiv:1603.07452

### EFT for spacetime symmetry breaking

 Breaking of spacetime symmetries (CPT, Lorentz) can be studied with an effective field theory (EFT) formalism (Standard Model Extension, or SME):

$$\mathcal{L}_{SME} = \mathcal{L}_{GR} + \frac{1}{4} h_{\mu\nu} \left( \hat{s}^{\mu\nu\rho\sigma} + \hat{q}^{\mu\nu\rho\sigma} + \hat{k}^{\mu\nu\rho\sigma} \right) h_{\rho\sigma}$$



TABLE I: Gauge-invariant operators in the quadratic gravitational action.

Kostelecky & Mewes, Phys. Lett. B757:510-514 (2016)

#### CA18108 QG-MM

25

#### EFT for spacetime symmetry breaking

• Lorentz-violating coefficients from SME can be constrained from speed of gravity



ł	This Work Lower	Coefficient	This Work Upper
0	$-2 \times 10^{-14}$	$ar{s}_{00}^{(4)}$	$5 \times 10^{-15}$
1	$-3 \times 10^{-14}$	$ar{s}_{10}^{(4)}$	$7 \times 10^{-15}$
	$-1 \times 10^{-14}$	$-{ m Re}\ \bar{s}_{11}^{(4)}$	$2  imes 10^{-15}$
	$-3 \times 10^{-14}$	Im $\bar{s}_{11}^{(4)}$	$7 \times 10^{-15}$
2	$-4 \times 10^{-14}$	$-\bar{s}_{20}^{(4)}$	$8 \times 10^{-15}$
	$-1 \times 10^{-14}$	$-{\rm Re}\ \bar{s}_{21}^{(4)}$	$2 \times 10^{-15}$
	$-4 \times 10^{-14}$	Im $\bar{s}_{21}^{(4)}$	$8 \times 10^{-15}$
	$-1 \times 10^{-14}$	Re $\bar{s}_{22}^{(4)}$	$3 \times 10^{-15}$
	$-2  imes 10^{-14}$	$-\text{Im } \bar{s}_{22}^{(4)}$	$4 \times 10^{-15}$

LVC, Fermi, Integral, Astrophys.J.Lett. 848 (2017) 2, L13

### Outline: tests with gravitational waves signals

- Gravitational waves physics
  - $\mapsto$  nature and sources
  - $\mapsto$  detectors and instruments
  - └→ detection status
  - → analysis methods
- Propagation tests with multi messenger events
- └→ gravitational waves friction
- └→ gravitational waves lensing
- └→ speed of gravity
- └→ tests of Lorentz invariance violation

#### Propagation tests with gravitational waves signals

- → modified dispersion relation
- $\mapsto$  mass of the graviton
- → tests of Lorentz invariance & CPT breaking
- → anisotropies and spacetime birefringence

### Gravitational waves propagation

General relativity (GR) case:

$$h_{ij}'' + 2 H h_{ij} + c^{2} k^{2} h_{ij} = 0$$

$$\underbrace{\text{Modified GR}}_{97, 104037 (2018)}$$

$$h_{ij}'' + (2 + \nu) H h_{ij} + (c_{T}^{2}k^{2} + a^{2}\mu^{2}) h_{ij} = a^{2} \Gamma \gamma_{ij}$$

$$\underbrace{\text{Mass of graviton}}_{\text{graviton}}$$
Non-0 graviton
$$\underbrace{\text{mass}}_{\text{mass}}$$

### Lorentz invariance violation induced GW dispersion

•GW from the coalescence of compact binaries have a characteristic signal

 $h(t) = |h(t)| e^{-i (\omega(t) + \phi_c)}$ 

with  $|h(t)|, \omega(t)$  increasing until merger



 Breaking of Lorentz symmetry & massive graviton modify the energy relation:

$$E^2 = p^2 c^2 + m_g^2 c^4 + \mathbb{A} p^\alpha c^\alpha$$

 The extra term in A creates a frequencydependent dispersion of the GW

$$\tilde{h}(f) = |\tilde{h}(f)| e^{-i(\tilde{\phi}_{GR}(f) + \delta\tilde{\phi}(f))}$$

- The dispersion is:
- isotropic
- polarisation independent
- possibly mapped to alternative theories of gravitation

Mirshekari, Yunes & Will
Phys. Rev. D85: 024041 (2012)

#### Constraints on modified dispersion relation

• Constraints on A from GWTC-3:  $E^2 = p^2 c^2 + m_g^2 c^4 + A p^{\alpha} c^{\alpha}$ 

LVK, arxiv:2112.06861



#### Constraints on modified dispersion relation

• Constraints on A from GWTC-3:  $E^2 = p^2 c^2 + m_g^2 c^4 + A p^{\alpha} c^{\alpha}$ 

LVK, arxiv:2112.06861



w/ GW200219_094415 & GW200225_060421
w/o GW200219_094415 & GW200225_060421

2 events presenting a bias with lowest p-value in residual tests

31

### Gravitational waves propagation

General relativity (GR) case:

$$h_{ij}'' + 2 H h_{ij} + c^{2} k^{2} h_{ij} = 0$$

$$\underbrace{\text{Modified GR}}_{97, 104037 (2018)}$$

$$h_{ij}'' + (2 + \nu) H h_{ij} + (c_{T}^{2}k^{2} + a^{2}\mu^{2}) h_{ij} = a^{2} \Gamma \gamma_{ij}$$

$$\underbrace{\text{Polarisation}}_{\text{mixing}}$$

$$h_{t} \text{ and } h_{x}$$

### EFT for spacetime symmetry breaking

 Breaking of spacetime symmetries (CPT, Lorentz) can be studied with an effective field theory (EFT) formalism (Standard Model Extension, or SME):

$$\mathcal{L} = \mathcal{L}_{GR} + \frac{1}{4} h_{\mu\nu} \left( \hat{s}^{\mu\nu\rho\sigma} + \hat{q}^{\mu\nu\rho\sigma} + \hat{k}^{\mu\nu\rho\sigma} \right) h_{\rho\sigma}$$



TABLE I: Gauge-invariant operators in the quadratic gravitational action.

Kostelecky & Mewes, Phys. Lett. B757:510-514 (2016)

#### CA18108 QG-MM

33

#### Polarisation-dependent, anisotropic dispersion

• New fields coupling with the metric: dispersion impacting the GW signal



Mewes, Phys. Rev. D 99, 104062 (2019)

CA18108 QG-MM

### Measuring SME coefficients for d=5

• **Dispersion**: starts at mass dimension d = 5controlled by 16 coefficients  $k_{(V),ij}^{(d=5)}$ 

includes Lorentz invariance and CPT breaking

• Modified GW signal:  $h_{+} = \cos \beta h_{+}^{GR} - \sin \beta h_{\times}^{GR}$  $\beta = \omega^{2} \tau \sum_{i=16} Y_{i,j} k_{(V)ij}^{(d=5)}$ 



Ault-O'Neal, Bailey, Dumerchat, Haegel, Tasson, Universe 2021, 7(10), 380 (2021)

#### Constraints from individual events

• **Analysis**: GWTC-3 (O1 + O2 + O3)

45 events with higher SNR chosen (FAR > 2 / year) joint measurement of source and SME parameters

• **Constraints**: individual =  $\mathcal{O}(10^{-13})$ 

combined =  $\mathcal{O}(10^{-15})$ 



#### Constraints from combined events



### Robustness of the analysis

#### Impact of waveform model

How the  $h_{+,\times}^{GR}$  modelling impact the SME constraints



# Correlation with source parameters How the SME posteriors depend on the astrophysical parameters





### Conclusion

- GW enable to test several beyond-GR phenomenology:
- speed of gravity
- graviton mass
- spacetime symmetry breaking
- scalar-tensor theories of gravitation
- "agnostic" deviations
- Current sensitivities are still relatively low
   next generation instruments will probe a larger volume of the Universe
- 3G terrestrial detectors: Einstein Telescope /
- Cosmic Explorer can detect up to z = 100
- Spatial mission: LISA will have access to lower frequencies & higher redshifts





### Supplementary material

### Alternatives theories of gravity

#### Doubly special relativity:

Modification of special relativity with the addition of an observer-independent maximum energy ; length scale (Planck length / energy). Motivation: same scale of quantum gravity effects for all observers <u>Amelino-Camelia</u>, <u>Symmetry 2 (2010) 230-271</u>

#### Hořava-Lifshitz gravity:

Quantisation of gravitation with a QFT approach, where ghosts are avoided by introducing anisotropic scaling between space and time at high energies <u>Wang, Int. J. Mod. Phys. D26 (2017) 1730014</u>

#### • DGP gravity:

Extension of the Einstein-Hilbert action to a 4+1 Minkowski space. Motivation: acceleration of the Universe expansion without  $\Lambda$ .

Dvali, Gabadadze, Porrati. Phys. Lett. B 485:208-214 (2000)

#### Horndeski (and beyond) gravity:

General formulation of scalar-tensor theory of gravitation (includes Brans-Dicke, DHOST, linked to Gauss-Bonet). Particularly used to study inflation, metric perturbation, cosmological effects. <u>Kobayashi. Rept. Prog. Phys. 82 (2019) no.8, 086901</u>

#### ► f(R) gravity:

Class of beyond-GR theory where the Ricci scalar R follows an arbitrary function. Presence of equivalence with scalar-tensor theories for GW.

Sotiriou, Faraoni. Rev. Mod. Phys. 82:451-497 (2010)

### Gravitational waves detection with interferometry

- The variation of space-time interval is measured with light interferometry.
- A light beam is divided in two beams travelling along orthogonal arms.
- Mirrors in the end of the arms reflect the beams back to a photodetector.
- If no gravitational wave passes through, the arm length remains the same and the interference pattern is the sum of the splitted electromagnetic waves.



### Gravitational waves detection with interferometry

- The variation of space-time interval is measured with light interferometry.
- A light beam is divided in two beams travelling along orthogonal arms.
- Mirrors in the end of the arms reflect the beams back to a photodetector.
- If a gravitational wave passes through, the arm length is different and the interference pattern is distorted.



# LIGO-Virgo sensitivities

- Ground-based light interferometers are sensitive to the **frequency range 10 10³ Hz**
- Signals entering the detection range are coalescence of compact binaries (stellarmass black holes or neutron stars) and possibly pulsars





### GW detection



#### Database automatically updated:

- <u>GraceDB</u> contains low-latency information about the event
- In case of possible neutron star, alert sent to satellites and telescopes to search for electromagnetic counterpart

#### **Detection range:** during O3a run

#### Different type of searches:

- 4 modelled searches pipelines
- 2 unmodelled searches pipelines



# Candidate identification with modelled searches

#### Modelled search:

- algorithms comparing template ____nks signals with datastream _____
- calibrated to binary black
   calibrated with asses in [2 750]
- matched filtered cor tic ggers det ti
- ► 3 different pipe es: A, yCBC, St_L



### Candidate identification with unmodelled searches

#### • Unmodelled search:

- Search for coherent excess power
- Target events not in template banks (supernovae, spacetime defects, etc)
- ► 1 pipeline: cWB



### All GW sources ever detected

# Masses in the Stellar Graveyard



LIGO-Virgo-KAGRA | Aaron Geller | Northwestern

### O3a event properties



GW190408_181802		$\rightarrow$	$\rightarrow$	HLV	BBH
GW190412			-	HLV	BBH
GW190413_052954		$\rightarrow$		HLV	BBH
GW190413_134308		$ \rightarrow $		HLV	BBH
GW190421_213856		$\rightarrow$	$ \longrightarrow $	HL	BBH
GW190424_180648		$\rightarrow$		L	BBH
GW190425			ł	LV	BNS
GW190426_152155		$\checkmark$	♦-	HLV	<b>BBH/NSBH</b>
GW190503_185404		$\rightarrow$	$\sim$	HLV	BBH
GW190512_180714		$\rightarrow$	- <b>&gt;</b>	HLV	BBH
GW190513_205428	$\leftarrow$	$\rightarrow$	$\rightarrow$	HLV	BBH
GW190514_065416		$ \longrightarrow $		HL	BBH
GW190517_055101		$\rightarrow$	$\sim$	HLV	BBH
GW190519_153544		$\rightarrow$	$\leftarrow$	HLV	BBH
GW190521		$ \longrightarrow $		HLV	BBH
GW190521_074359		$\diamond$	$\checkmark$	HL	BBH
GW190527_092055		$ \rightarrow $		HL	BBH
GW190602_175927		$ \rightarrow $		HLV	BBH
GW190620_030421		$\rightarrow$		LV	BBH
GW190630_185205		$\rightarrow$	$\diamond$	LV	BBH
GW190701_203306		$ \longrightarrow $	$\leftarrow$	HLV	BBH
GW190706_222641		$ \rightarrow $		HLV	BBH
GW190707_093326		<b>~</b>	$\diamond$	HL	BBH
GW190708_232457		- <b>&gt;</b>	$\diamond$	LV	BBH
GW190719_215514		$ \rightarrow $		HL	BBH
GW190720_000836		- <b>&gt;</b>	<	HLV	BBH
GW190727_060333		$\rightarrow$		HLV	BBH
GW190728_064510		$\rightarrow$		HLV	BBH
GW190731_140936		$\rightarrow$		HL	BBH
GW190803_022701		$ \rightarrow $		HLV	BBH
GW190814	+	<b>→</b>	ł	LV	BBH/NSBH
GW190828_063405		$\rightarrow$	$\rightarrow$	HLV	BBH
GW190828_065509		$\rightarrow$	<b>~</b>	HLV	BBH
GW190909_114149				HL	BBH
GW190910_112807				LV	BBH
GW190915_235702				HLV	BBH
GW190924_021846			♦-	HLV	BBH
GW190929_012149				HLV	BBH
GW190930_133541			<b>—</b>	HL	BBH
0 50 100	0 0.0 0.5 1.0	-1 0 1	0 3 6		

q

 $\chi_{\rm eff}$ 

 $m_1/M_{\odot}$ 

 $D_{\rm L}/{\rm Gpc}$ 

#### O3b event properties

GW191103_012549 GW191105_143521 GW191109_010717 GW191113_071753 GW191126_115259 GW191127_050227 GW191129_134029 GW191204_110529 GW191204_171526  $GW191215_223052$ GW191216_213338 GW191219_163120 GW191222_033537 GW191230_180458 GW200105_162426 GW200112_155838 GW200115_042309  $GW200128_022011$ GW200129_065458 GW200202_154313 GW200208_130117  $GW200208_{222617}$ GW200209_085452 GW200210_092254 GW200216_220804 GW200219_094415 GW200220_061928 GW200220_124850  $GW200224_{222234}$ GW200225_060421 GW200302_015811 GW200306_093714 GW200308_173609* GW200311_115853  $GW200316_{215756}$ GW200322_091133*



### Network observation plan

- 2 more observation runs planned (up to 2027)
- Post O5 plans under discussion

